

# Sample Student Responses for Question 1

## Student Response 1 (score of 9)

Write in the box the number of the question you are answering on this page as it is designated in the examination.

Part A

From 1450 to 1700, European <sup>society</sup> ~~was~~ ~~changed~~ considerably due to the effects of the Commercial Revolution and the rise of the ~~middle class~~ ~~as~~ a bourgeoisie or professional class in importance. One of the major effects ~~of~~ of the Commercial Revolution was the worsening conditions of the poor. Attitudes and responses varied among social classes from benevolence to disgust; these views were <sup>often</sup> ~~usually~~ colored by personal interest in a given situation.

The condition of the poor itself was a contentious issue. Some, such as the Spanish humanist Juan Luis Vives, viewed the plight of the poor as the result of society's harshness ~~towards the poor~~ (D3). ~~Because~~ Because Vives lived in Spain, it is likely that he sympathized with the Catholic belief in almsgiving, unlike ~~many~~ other critics of the poor, who ~~would~~ would not benefit from helping ~~to~~ the poor. The wealthy merchant Jean Maillefer saw the poor in a different way, noting that they had no worries due to their lack of responsibility (D11). Maillefer implies that the condition of the poor is a choice, made by idle people.

Both Vives' and Maillefer's <sup>views</sup> represent polar opposite arguments based on social status. Responses to these views would also vary based on position. ~~However,~~ ~~and~~ ~~was~~ ~~from~~ However, ~~there~~ a third position existed in the debate over responses — that of town councils. ~~The~~ In the late 15<sup>th</sup> century, the French town council at Dijon ~~resolved~~ resolved that

the poor should be cared for as well as possible (D2).  
The council implies that doing so will ease unrest in the town. A similar council in 16<sup>th</sup> century Rouen had a different response: it proposed to expell those who were unwilling to work in order to discourage idleness.

The council coldly noted that before doing so, they ~~must~~ must evaluate the defensive capacity of the city, for those workers would ~~make~~ be useful as soldiers - something a professional would not do (D5).  
Public councils therefore resolved to act in the best interest of the town, not the poor.

Many viewed the poor as the Rouen council did as idle and therefore detrimental to their interests. The professional class, who stood to gain the most from ~~putting~~ putting the poor to work, viewed the ~~poor~~ poor as idle. In 1555, Dr. William Turner wrote an account of ~~poor~~ some beggars he had met, <sup>implying</sup> ~~indicating~~, as Maillefer later would, that the poor preferred to beg because it freed them from responsibility (D6).

~~The poor~~ ~~viewing class~~ also viewed the poor's idleness in a ~~negative~~ ~~light~~ As a result of these views, poorhouses, such as that in Suffolk County, England, were created to combat ~~idleness~~ begging. The ~~excessively~~ excessively harsh conditions there (D7) were mean to force the poor into submission and therefore ~~ob~~ obedient.

to the desires of those who would rather see them working.

The ruling classes also disliked the ~~poor~~ poor for their idleness, but they instead attempted to aid the poor. The Holy Roman Emperor Charles V advocated almsgiving (D4), and the ~~notorious~~ royal councilor Cardinal Richelieu proposed ~~regulations~~ a system of public works (D8). These rulers thought ~~of~~ of the benefit of their countries but also of religion as a factor — both were Catholic and believed in ~~good~~ good works as essential to salvation.

The Catholic church ~~was~~ and its clergy were constantly concerned with giving to the poor, completely the opposite of the bourgeoisie. As early as the fifteenth century, Catholic priests were preaching that believers must give to the poor because money is worldly and ~~therefore~~ not important for salvation (D1). The ~~importance~~ <sup>emphasis</sup> on almsgiving heightened in the subsequent centuries due to the spread of Protestantism, which included Luther's repudiation of good works as central to salvation. With the Counter-Reformation underway, the Church began to ~~re~~ reaffirm its ~~old~~ teachings, resulting in an increasing trend of benevolence to the poor. The message of the Council of Trent and the Counter-Reformation appeared ~~in~~ in art, such as in

Rembrandt van Rijn's "Beggars Receiving Alms" (DA), which depicted the poor as gentle and dignified. Religious orders ministering the poor were also created; Vincent de Paul, the leader of one such group, emphasized the saintliness of good works (D10), even more emphatic than the Catholic priest of the fifteenth century had thanks to ~~the~~ the Counter-Reformation. Like his ~~Attitudes throughout~~ predecessor, he emphasized almsgiving in the Catholic tradition.

Attitudes throughout Europe is ~~the~~ ~~years~~ from 1450-1700 varied based on social position and personal interest, from the ruling classes to merchants to clergy.

### Commentary

- This essay earns all core points; it demonstrates significant additional analysis.
- It has a solid thesis, which is well sustained over the course of the essay; it uses all documents.
- The essay has a strong and consistent analysis of POV for documents 3 and 7. It also analyzes POV for groups of documents: rulers [4, 8], professionals [6, 11], towns [2, 5], and clergy [1, 10].
- The essay groups the documents in the following ways: attitudes [Vives vs. Maillefer], towns, rulers, professionals and clergy.
- It uses outside information well, particularly on Protestantism and Counter-Reformation for POV.
- There is sustained and often sophisticated analysis, particularly of change over time.
- The essay distinguishes between attitudes and responses.
- A minor error is made with regard to Rembrandt reflecting Counter-Reformation attitudes.